1	COMMUNICATIONS WORKERS OF AMERICA								
2									
3									
4									
5	Report of the Appeals Committee to the								
6	4th Biennial								
7	Presidents Meeting								
8									
9									
10									
11	Hyatt Regency								
12	400 New Jersey Ave, N.W.								
13	Washington, DC 20001								
14									
15									
16									
17	Monday, June 11, 2018								
18	9:00 a.m.								
19									
20									
21									
22									

1	APPEARANCES:
2	NATIONAL EXECUTIVE BOARD
3	Chris Shelton, President
4	Sara Steffens, Secretary-Treasurer
5	Dennis Trainor, Vice President, District 1
6	Edward Mooney, Vice President, District 2-13
7	Richard Honeycutt, Vice President, District 3
8	Linda Hinton, Vice President, District 4
9	Claude Cummings, Vice President, District 6
10	Brenda Roberts, Vice President, District 7
11	Tom Runnion, Vice President, District 9
12	Lisa Bolton, Vice President, Telecommunications
13	& Technologies Sector
14	Charlie Braico, President, NABET-CWA
15	Dan Wasser, Executive Officer, PPMWS
16	Brooks Sunkett, Vice President, Public,
17	Healthcare & Education Workers
18	Bernie Lunzer, President, TNG-CWA
19	Jim Clark, Division President, IUE-CWA

Sara Nelson, International President, AFA-CWA

Carolyn Wade, Northeast Region Executive Board

Martin O'Hanlon, President, CWA-SCA Canada

20

21

22

1	APPEARANCES (CONTINUED):
2	Member-at-Large
3	Anetra Session, Central Region Executive Board
4	Member-at-Large
5	Frank Arce, Western Region Executive Board
б	Member-at-Large
7	Vera Mikell, Southeast Regional Executive Board
8	Member-at-Large
9	Marge Krueger, Chair of the Credentials
10	Committee
11	APPEALS COMMITTEE:
12	Cori Gambini, President, CWA Local 1168
13	Sarah Harreus, President, CWA Local 6450
14	Donald Alire, President, CWA Local 7076
15	Orange Richardson, President, CWA Local 9410
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	

-	1	D	R	$\cap$	$\mathcal{C}$	E	$\mathbf{F}$	D	Т	M	$\mathbf{C}$	S

- 2 (9:05 a.m.)
- 3 CHAIRMAN SHELTON: Can the Sergeant-at-Arms
- 4 get the people out in the hall to come in? Can
- 5 the delegates take their seats please?
- 6 Good morning brothers and sisters, welcome
- 7 to the 2018 Biennial Presidents Meeting. Will
- 8 everyone please rise for the Pledge of Allegiance?
- 9 (Pledge of Allegiance)
- 10 CHAIRMAN SHELTON: Brothers and sisters,
- 11 today before I give off on our Presidents Meeting,
- 12 I'm going to take a few minutes to talk about our
- 13 union -- the impact of the attacks on us, and how we
- 14 must adapt to the new conditions if we are to
- 15 survive.
- 16 We at CWA are privileged. We live and
- 17 work under union contracts in an era of declining
- 18 union membership. The next battle in the ongoing war
- 19 on unions is at the Supreme Court, which may rule
- 20 today to eliminate agency fees throughout the public
- 21 sector.
- The case is known as Janus. The Supreme

- 1 Court's decision will reverse 40 years of law and
- 2 will reduce union resources without reducing our
- 3 obligations to represent employees. It will impact
- 4 Public Sector unions and units the most, but it will
- 5 affect each and every one of us.
- 6 Anticipating this attack, CWA's response
- 7 was to use our strategic industry funds so-wisely
- 8 created by you at the 2006 convention to build a
- 9 stronger CWA. At the first whiff of the elimination of
- 10 agency fees in the Public Sector, two and a half
- 11 years ago, we kicked off our CWA Strong Program and
- 12 we've done phenomenal work.
- Today we have 7,383 more members in our
- 14 Public Sector locals than we did in 2016. Yeah,
- that's absolutely worth celebrating. 7,383 more CWA
- 16 members, because we aggressively went out and
- 17 systematically talked about the value of our union to
- 18 members and non-members alike.
- 19 Based on the success of that internal
- 20 organizing and union building, we expanded the CWA
- 21 Strong Program to the private sector. At our last
- 22 convention, many of you signed the CWA Strong Pledge to

- 1 increase our membership density and to take numerous
- 2 steps to build our steward and activist networks.
- 3 As a local president, you are a critical
- 4 leader in this fight -- you and your stewards and
- 5 activists are the face of the union in the workplace.
- 6 Every day you must wake up and think about how many
- 7 members and non-members you have. How are they
- 8 engaged in our union?
- 9 What am I doing to build my local, to
- 10 increase my activists and stewards? You and your
- 11 local -- large and small, are where CWA will live or
- 12 die. This challenge isn't an easy one. It requires
- 13 time, energy, and resources, and it may require us to
- 14 change, but change we must.
- We must examine our administrative
- 16 structures to see if they still work, and we are
- 17 proactively doing that. The same is true with our
- 18 traditional steward's training. I recently reviewed
- 19 our training program, and it spends 45 minutes on
- 20 internal organizing and mobilizing members, and the
- 21 rest of the two days on the finer points of handling
- 22 individual worker's problems.

- We must spend more time teaching our
- 2 stewards to be organizers and mobilizers. I
- 3 instructed our staff to completely rewrite the
- 4 steward's training program. Stewards are the union
- 5 at the worksite. And when we've completed the
- 6 rewrite, we will need your help for us to push out
- 7 this new training for old and new stewards alike.
- 8 Some of you -- like IUE-CWA Local 86787 in
- 9 Tyler, Texas, have already begun. They have
- 10 recognized a need to invest in their steward network
- 11 and are training all 50 stewards to be internal
- 12 organizing -- internal organizers.
- Not only do we need stewards in every
- 14 workplace, but we need every member to understand
- 15 that our power as a union grows from the bottom up.
- 16 Member engagement is the critical foundation of every
- 17 single fight that we are going to have. We see the
- 18 power of members in action in the recent rounds of
- 19 strikes, starting in West Virginia where teachers and
- 20 other public education workers stood up and walked
- 21 out and won for themselves new self-respect and a pay
- 22 raise and improvements in teaching conditions.

- 1 They were followed by teachers in
- 2 Oklahoma, Arizona, Kentucky, North Carolina and
- 3 Colorado. This red state revolt is member-led and
- 4 inspirational. We are seeing this brand of
- 5 militancy spread to our own members.
- 6 Our members at Frontier in West Virginia
- 7 walked out to protect job security for all members
- 8 and stayed out for three weeks until they had won
- 9 that job security. If you are from West Virginia
- 10 stand up, stand up and be recognized.
- 11 Last week throughout the Midwest and in
- 12 TNT, members at AT&T spontaneously walked off the job
- 13 in an unfair labor practice strike. They were
- 14 protesting AT&T's high-handed direct dealing with our
- 15 members and by-passing their elected members at the
- 16 bargaining table.
- 17 The strike spread across District 4. This
- is a pure grassroots energy, spontaneous and
- 19 righteous. I have -- I am enormously proud of our
- 20 members for taking their future into their own hands.
- 21 If you're from District 4 or AT&T, stand up and be
- 22 recognized. Stand up.

- 1 We've had enough of corporate arrogance.
- 2 We've had enough of the 1% and the network peddlers
- 3 waging class war on us. We are standing up and
- 4 fighting back. We are CWA Strong.
- 5 We need this kind of energy to drive our
- 6 union programs. We will not survive if we only
- 7 handle member's individual problems. We must return
- 8 to our early roots -- a time when members dug into
- 9 their own pockets and ponied up bus fare for CWA's
- 10 first president, Joe Beirne, to travel to the next
- 11 city to build our union.
- 12 Members built this union, reached into
- 13 their pockets and built this union. We are not a
- 14 vending machine where members put in money and get
- 15 service back -- they have to be involved.
- 16 Our financial resources are shrinking, but
- 17 our members' energy is limitless. Yes, we are a
- 18 strong union. Yes, you are strong leaders, but we
- 19 need our members to be more engaged in their fights
- 20 than ever before.
- We need to develop our leadership skills
- 22 to engage more members in our movement. Members --

- 1 united and standing together are the keys to keeping
- 2 CWA Strong. As the labor ballad says, "There is no
- 3 power greater anywhere beneath the sun."
- Brothers and sisters, we cannot -- we will
- 5 not survive if we don't make these changes. I will
- 6 not let CWA die on my watch. Are you with me? Come
- 7 on are you with me? Will you commit? Will you
- 8 commit to building CWA Strong? Will you be there
- 9 with me? Will you be there with our members?
- 10 Under Secretary-Treasurer Steffens' able
- 11 leadership, we began two years ago to prepare our
- 12 union to survive the Janus decision. She will give
- 13 you a detailed financial report following the
- 14 Presidents Meeting and our Constitutional business.
- 15 She has been a terrific partner in
- 16 managing our union through these turbulent times --
- 17 give her a round of applause. The adjustment to our
- 18 new economic reality will be hard. We are replacing
- 19 one staff for every two departures and have been
- 20 doing that for quite a while.
- 21 There will be fewer staff in the near

- 1 future than there are today. We are cutting all
- 2 other expenses, which we can control, by 25%. It means
- 3 that you cannot expect staff to play the same role as
- 4 they did in the "good old days" -- those days are
- 5 over.
- One of my favorite quotes is, "10,000
- 7 times has the labor movement stumbled and bruised
- 8 itself." We have been enjoined by the courts,
- 9 assaulted by thugs, charged by the militia, traduced
- 10 by the press, frowned upon in public opinion and
- 11 deceived by politicians. But notwithstanding all
- 12 this and all these -- labor is today the most vital
- 13 and potential power this planet has ever known, and
- 14 its historic mission is as certain of ultimate
- 15 realization as is the setting of the sun.
- But in order to thrive, we will need to
- 17 double down on good old fashioned union-building by
- 18 going back to basics. Some of you are unlocking new
- 19 resources through CWA Strong, and you are succeeding
- 20 in building and growing your locals.
- 21 In Florida, our public sector units will
- 22 not face the extinction planned for them by our

- 1 right-wing Florida state legislature. They are
- 2 working on passing legislation which would eliminate
- 3 any public sector unit with less than 50% membership.
- 4 Because our locals changed, embraced the
- 5 CWA Strong Program and kicked off a major internal
- 6 organizing program, they beat back this right-wing
- 7 attack. Local 3181 for example, stand up -- raised
- 8 its membership, raised its membership in each of its
- 9 public sector units above the critical threshold and
- 10 moved some as high as, listen to this -- 98%, they
- 11 were less than 50% when they started.
- 12 In addition, and this is just as
- 13 important, the local committed to use all the
- 14 additional local dues funds it will receive to
- 15 continue to build internally. This is change.
- 16 This is the best way to make CWA Strong, and we are
- 17 doing it across this union -- across the south, and
- 18 now the north. We have units that are CWA Strong in
- 19 right-to-work-for-less states where every member is a
- 20 volunteer.
- 21 In Michigan and Indiana, the anti-union

- 1 legislators tried to weaken us by enacting right-to-
- 2 work-for-less laws, but we reached out and engaged
- 3 every member. As a result, CWA is stronger and we
- 4 have fewer non-members in those states than we did
- 5 before they passed those right-to-work-for-less laws.
- 6 Throughout the public sector we've stepped
- 7 up the anti-union attacks and are building our union.
- 8 In New Jersey through CWA Strong, CWA led a training
- 9 program for our stewards to become internal
- 10 organizers with 50 trainers and over 600 stewards.
- 11 They spent the day practicing their internal
- 12 organizing and union building skills.
- 13 They did not put internal organizing on
- 14 the back burner because they were too busy and had to
- 15 face their collective bargaining crisis. They did
- 16 not put internal organizing on the back burner to
- 17 wait for political change. They did not put
- 18 internal organizing on the back burner to ratify
- 19 their contract.
- 20 Instead, they built internal organizing
- 21 into each and every one of the union strategies to
- 22 overcome those crises. As a result, we have fewer fee

- 1 payers there than ever before in history. Give them
- 2 a round of applause.
- 3 Every local is above 75% organized and
- 4 together they average just over 80%. Brothers and
- 5 Sisters, to blunt the attack of the anti-union 1%, we
- 6 cannot be solely focused on the representation side
- 7 of the CWA triangle.
- 8 Community action and organizing are more
- 9 important now than ever. History teaches us that it
- 10 is during the upswing of movement activity that the
- 11 working class gains ground for our families and
- 12 communities.
- We ended child labor and won an 8-hour
- 14 work day and established Social Security during the
- 15 New Deal uprisings and the first wave of industrial
- organizing in the 1930s. In the '60s and '70s, we
- 17 created Medicare and OSHA as public sector unionism
- 18 climbed.
- 19 Our gains were achieved during times of
- 20 mass movements, great upheavals and rejection of the
- 21 status quo. In recreating these conditions, the
- 22 community action side of the CWA triangle will be the

- 1 topic for the next two days of the Legislative
- 2 Conference. On the third side of the CWA triangle,
- 3 external organizing with organizing labor hovering on
- 4 life support -- we need big bold ideas and action.
- Not everything we try will succeed, but we
- 6 will learn from our successes and also our failures,
- 7 but we must be bold. It was bold for us to challenge
- 8 Wall Street and the bankers who control the CEOs who
- 9 run the companies where our members are employed.
- 10 It was bold for us to create the Committee
- 11 for Better Banks as the bequest of bank unions from
- 12 around the globe. And we had success. We challenged
- 13 the U.S. financial sector, winning the elimination of
- 14 sales goals as part of compensation plans and
- 15 pushing up the minimum wage to \$15.00 an hour in the
- 16 financial sector.
- 17 But these important efforts which enhance
- 18 CWA across Capitol Hill have not led to membership
- 19 growth for CWA, and I am impatient. But, I am also
- 20 committed to other organizing experiments that will
- 21 lead to more CWA members.
- It is bold for us to take on the wireless

- 1 industry. Dennis Trainor from District 1 insisted
- 2 during Unity at Mobility that we be bold, and our
- 3 members responded in an unprecedented four-day
- 4 strike. We have pushed AT&T Mobility members out
- 5 front to organizing Verizon Wireless and T-Mobile, and
- 6 our members have responded with thousands of contacts
- 7 of colleagues working in the non-union side of the
- 8 industry.
- 9 Richard Honeycutt, along with Nick Hawkins
- 10 and Tom Smith, have chosen to build a membership
- 11 organization without collective bargaining at the
- 12 colleges of the Southeast -- the SEC colleges for
- 13 all you college football fans.
- 14 Building on the experience of the District
- 15 6 Texas State Employee Union and the recent successes
- 16 of the United Campus Workers in Tennessee, we've
- 17 committed to grow membership across the south and
- 18 similar organizations.
- 19 My hat is off to all those Tennessee
- 20 locals who have supported this effort using their
- 21 political leverage and spending their time to fight
- 22 against privatization. If you're from Tennessee,

- 1 stand up and be recognized.
- 2 AFA-CWA continues to build our union,
- 3 adding new members and winning contracts for our
- 4 flight attendants. We've added over 1,500 members
- 5 this year in that sector alone. As part of CWA
- 6 Strong, AFA-CWA is putting an emphasis on building
- 7 Human Rights Committees this year.
- 8 In the Media sector, it is rewarding to
- 9 hear Bernie Lunzer's report that nearly 1,000 members
- 10 are now seeking to join CWA. Journalists at
- 11 historically anti-union employers are coming to
- 12 understand the fight for industry standards and the
- 13 need to preserve our democracy through a collective
- 14 action.
- The pendulum, Brothers and Sisters, is
- 16 beginning to swing our way. The future is ours to
- 17 make. It starts with you. These times are tough, but
- 18 we're tougher. The challenges are great, but our
- 19 union is greater.
- 20 Stand with me and build CWA Strong. Stand
- 21 with me and build CWA Strong. CWA, CWA, CWA, CWA,
- 22 CWA, CWA Strong, thank you, and now let me move to the

- 1 opening of our formal meeting.
- 2 (Applause.)
- 3 CHAIRMAN SHELTON: Pursuant to Article 9,
- 4 Section 7 of the CWA Constitution, this local
- 5 Presidents Meeting has been called to hear and
- 6 resolve any pending appeals of the Executive Board
- 7 decisions as issued to date.
- 8 That is the only business before this
- 9 meeting. With that said I would like to recognize
- 10 the National Executive Board and ask them please to
- 11 stand as I say their names: Sara Steffens,
- 12 Secretary-Treasurer; Dennis Trainor, Vice President
- of District 1; Ed Mooney, Vice-President, District
- 14 2-13; Richard Honeycutt, Vice President, District 3,
- 15 Linda Hinton, Vice President, District 4;
- 16 Claude Cummings, Vice President, District
- 17 6; Brenda Roberts, Vice President, District 7; Tom
- 18 Runnion, Vice President, District 9; Lisa Bolton, Vice
- 19 President, Telecommunications and Technology; Brooks
- 20 Sunkett, Vice President, Public Health Care and
- 21 Education Workers; Bernie Lunzer, President, TNG-CWA;
- 22 Charlie Braico, President, NABET-CWA; Jim Clark,

- 1 President, IUE-CWA;
- Sara Nelson, President, AFA-CWA; Dan
- 3 Wasser, PPMWS Executive Officer; Martin O'Hanlon,
- 4 President CWA-SCA Canada; Carolyn Wade, Northeast
- 5 Region Executive Board Member-at-Large; Anetra
- 6 Session, Central Region Executive Board Member-at-Large;
- 7 Frank Arce, Western Region Executive Board
- 8 Member-at-Large;
- 9 Vera Mikell, Southeast Regional Executive
- 10 Board Member-at-Large. Thank you.
- Now I'd like to bring to the microphone
- 12 the Chair of the Credentials Committee, Marge Krueger.
- MS. KRUEGER: Good morning, President
- 14 Shelton, delegates, retirees, and guests. I am
- 15 pleased to announce on behalf of the Credentials
- 16 Committee that the committee has registered 290
- 17 delegates and guests to this Presidents Meeting.
- 18 The committee appreciates the assistance
- 19 rendered by the Secretary-Treasurer's Office,
- 20 especially the help of the Information Services and
- 21 Membership Dues Department. With the assistance of
- 22 the two departments mentioned, we are continuing to

- 1 improve service to our delegates, retirees and
- 2 guests.
- 3 Since our last convention, new locals have
- 4 been added to our ranks. These locals are 3642,
- 5 21085, 24003, 3265 and 24029; let us welcome them.
- 6 We should be reporting on credentials in the
- 7 following categories: Category 1 -- those
- 8 credentials properly executed and received on time.
- 9 Category 2 -- credentials properly
- 10 executed but late; Category 3 -- improperly executed;
- 11 Category 4(A) -- proxy credentials properly executed
- 12 but late; Category 4(B) proxy credentials
- 13 improperly executed; Category 5 -- unusual
- 14 circumstances.
- 15 There are 255 credentials in Category 1 --
- 16 that's credentials properly executed and on time.
- 17 The committee moves that these delegates be seated.
- 18 CHAIRMAN SHELTON: Thank you, Marge. So I
- 19 will entertain a motion to adopt the Credentials
- 20 Committee report. Is there a second? All those in
- 21 favor please raise your hand; down hands -- opposed
- 22 by like sign -- the motion is approved.

- 1 MS. KRUEGER: There are no credentials in
- 2 Category 2, 3, 4A, 4B or 5. Those delegates other
- 3 than Category 1 who have not been seated by the
- 4 action of this convention may present themselves to
- 5 the committee and obtain their proper badges. Mr.
- 6 President and delegates, this completes the
- 7 committee's report at this time, thank you.
- 8 CHAIRMAN SHELTON: We also need a motion
- 9 from the floor to seat the delegates, is there a
- 10 motion? Is there a second? All those in favor
- 11 please raise your hand; down hands? Opposed by like
- 12 sign, the motion carries. Thanks, Marge.
- 13 So now I want to describe for you the use
- 14 of the microphones and how you get recognized to
- 15 speak, make motions, or ask questions. Also, we will
- 16 be using Robert's Rules of Order at this meeting.
- We have four microphones set up on the
- 18 floor. Microphone number 1 is where a delegate would
- 19 go to make a motion. The telephone associated with
- 20 this microphone is connected to our
- 21 parliamentarians. They are seated immediately behind
- 22 me. Will the parliamentarians please stand as I call

- 1 your name: Pat Shea, CWA General Counsel; Amy Young,
- 2 Administrative Director, District 1.
- 3 Microphone 2 is the "For" microphone.
- 4 Use it to be recognized to speak in favor of any
- 5 motion before the Presidents Meeting. Microphone 3
- 6 is the "Against" microphone. Use it to be
- 7 recognized to speak against any motion before the
- 8 Presidents Meeting. Microphone 4 is the "Privileged/
- 9 Questions" microphone. Use it to be recognized to
- 10 raise a point of privilege or to ask a question.
- 11 Each of these three microphones are
- 12 connected to staff on the platform. Will the staff
- 13 please rise as I call your name? At the "For"
- 14 microphone -- Tonya Moore, District 1; at the
- 15 "Against" microphone -- Mike Scholte, District 4; at
- 16 the "Privileged Questions" microphone -- Matt Harris,
- 17 District Counsel District 4.
- 18 Under our rules there is a five-minute
- 19 limit on any speech. Staff Ruth Marriott, T&T and
- 20 Linda Miller, District 2-13 will assist with this.
- 21 Please stand. We will rotate between the "For,"
- 22 "Against" and "Questions/Privileged" microphones in

- 1 that order.
- When you are recognized at any of the
- 3 microphones, please first state your name and local
- 4 number. During the course of the Presidents Meeting,
- 5 a verbatim record is being kept. This record will be
- 6 emailed to you. You will have 30 days to review the
- 7 record and report to us any errors you may wish to
- 8 have corrected.
- 9 To help us with who is to be recognized
- 10 and to be sure that we follow procedures as provided
- in the Constitution and to help me with close votes,
- 12 we have two delegates from the floor. For that
- 13 purpose today, we have two delegates -- I will
- 14 introduce them at this time -- Diana Markowski,
- 15 President, Local 13100, Maurice Washington, Executive
- 16 Vice President, Local 9400.
- 17 I would like to call the Appeals
- 18 Committee to the stage. As the Appeals Committee is
- 19 coming to the platform, I just want to read out a
- 20 case that the 2016 Presidents Meeting had ordered
- 21 arbitrary.
- 22 Dominic Patrignani, President of Local 81359

- 1 appealed the Executive Board's denial of a case for
- 2 arbitration to the 2016 Presidents Meeting, and
- 3 delegates ordered that case be arbitrated. The case
- 4 involved the upgrade of a member, Thomas Fogerty,
- 5 based on seniority and the subsequent revocation of
- 6 that upgrade because Mr. Fogerty had not yet achieved
- 7 an A rating as the company alleged was required by
- 8 the contract.
- 9 The case was settled after Mr. Fogerty was
- 10 awarded the position of Senior Lead Operator. The
- 11 2017 convention did not afford any cases to be
- 12 arbitrated. I'd like to introduce the Appeals
- 13 Committee as they come up -- they're already here.
- 14 Cori Gambini, President, CWA 1168, Chair; Johnny
- 15 Hernandez, President, CWA Local 3112 -- Johnny is not
- 16 here because of an illness. Sarah Harreus, President,
- 17 CWA Local 6450, Orange Richardson IV, President, CWA
- 18 Local 9410; Donald Alire, President, CWA Local 7076,
- 19 and assisting the Committee John Dempsey and Amy Young,
- 20 District 1 staff.
- 21 I'd like to call on President Gambini, the
- 22 Chair of the Appeals Committee to start the Appeals

- 1 Committee report. Sorry there's no microphone on the
- 2 table.
- MS. GAMBINI: Okay, thank you. Good
- 4 morning everyone: The Appeals Committee convened June
- 5 7th through June 10th, 2018, at the Washington Hyatt
- 6 Hotel in Washington, DC, for the purpose of receiving
- 7 and disposing of appeals in accordance with the CWA
- 8 Constitution and the internal appeals procedures of
- 9 the union as established by prior conventions and the
- 10 Executive Board.
- 11 The committee was available to meet with
- 12 interested parties on June 7th and June 10th, 2018,
- 13 between the hours of 2 p.m. through 6 p.m. Outside
- 14 of these hours the committee was available by
- 15 appointment. I would like to thank the committee
- 16 members Sarah Harreus, President, CWA Local 6450,
- 17 Donald Alire, President, CWA Local 7076 and Orange
- 18 Richardson IV, President, CWA Local 9410 for their hard
- 19 work and the time they devoted to these appeals.
- 20 Due to a medical issue, Appeals Committee
- 21 member Johnny Hernandez, President, CWA Local 3112
- 22 was unable to travel to Washington, DC, and

- 1 participate in this process. Also, the committee
- 2 thanks John Dempsey, Staff Representative, CWA
- 3 District 1 for his support and assistance.
- 4 The Chair recognizes President Donald
- 5 Alire, for Appeal 1.
- 6 MR. ALIRE: CWA Local 2108 President
- 7 Marilyn Irwin has appealed the decision of the CWA
- 8 Executive Board on a grievance filed by member Barry
- 9 Hill regarding the extension of his Regional
- 10 Attendance Plan (RAP) target date for the period of
- 11 time that he was out on strike.
- 12 The Executive Board upheld the decision of
- 13 President Shelton not to strike not to
- 14 arbitrate the grievance. The appeal is timely and
- 15 properly before the Presidents Meeting. Member Hill
- 16 was hired on February 3, 2000, as a consultant at
- 17 Verizon.
- On April 13th, 2016, member Hill joined his
- 19 brothers and sisters on the picket line. He returned
- 20 to work with the other strikers on June 1st, 2016.
- 21 Prior to the strike on January 12th, 2016, member
- 22 Hill was placed on step 3 of the Verizon RAP.

- 1 At that time, he was to regress to step 2
- 2 on a June 28th, 2016, target date if he did not have a
- 3 chargeable absence between those dates. On June
- 4 22nd, 2016, member Hill was informed that his target
- 5 date was extended until August 15th, 2016.
- 6 Member Hill was absent from July 28th to
- 7 August 22nd, 2016. The absence was not covered by
- 8 FMLA, so it was a chargeable absence. Member Hill was
- 9 placed on step 4 and suspended for 15 days.
- 10 Member Hill grieved the extension on his
- 11 target date from June 28th to August 15th of 2016.
- 12 President Irwin and member Hill argue that being out
- of work due to striking should not be used to extend
- 14 the order's target date under the RAP.
- The Appeals Committee agrees with the
- 16 decision of the Executive Board except to the extent
- 17 that the Executive Board stated that Local 2108 and
- 18 member Hill did not grieve the suspension that member
- 19 Hill received for his July 28th to August 22nd, 2016,
- absence.
- 21 While the grievance does not mention the
- 22 suspension, the grievance does allege that the

- 1 extension of member Hill's target date for being out
- 2 on strike violated his right to participate in union
- 3 activity.
- If the grievance was sustained, the
- 5 removal of the suspension would be the remedy.
- 6 Therefore, for all practical purposes the grievance
- 7 did not include the suspension. However, CWA is most
- 8 likely to prevail in arbitration -- most unlikely to
- 9 prevail in arbitration.
- 10 The RAP states that the employee must be
- 11 at work for six months without a chargeable absence to
- 12 regress to his or her prior step of the RAP. Member
- 13 Hill was not charged under the RAP for his strike
- 14 absence; however, the absence was still a period of
- 15 time when member Hill was not at work.
- 16 For that reason, Verizon extended the
- 17 target date in the same manner that it extends target
- 18 dates for other non-chargeable absences. In our
- 19 view, no arbitrator would find this interpretation to
- 20 be an unreasonable construction of the six-month
- 21 requirement.
- There is no evidence that any member was

- 1 treated differently as a result of participating in
- 2 the strike against Verizon in either 2011 or 2016.
- 3 Local 2108 President Irwin did appear before the
- 4 Appeals Committee and passionately presented her
- 5 case.
- 6 Unfortunately however, the committee
- 7 believes that President Irwin's arguments will be
- 8 unsuccessful and that CWA cannot prevail in
- 9 arbitration. Accordingly, the Appeals Committee
- 10 recommends that the decision of the Executive Board
- 11 be upheld and that the appeal of Local 2108 President
- 12 Marilyn Irwin, be denied.
- 13 CHAIRMAN SHELTON: You've heard the
- 14 Appeals Committee recommendation in Appeal Number 1.
- 15 Is there any discussion? It's kind of hard to see
- 16 the microphones with these lights folks, but you
- 17 know, if I miss somebody make noise. Yeah -- seeing
- 18 no one at the "For" microphone, we'll go to the
- 19 "Against" microphone -- the delegate at the "Against"
- 20 microphone please announce your name and your local
- 21 number.
- 22 MS. IRWIN: Good morning, Chris. My name

- 1 is Marilyn Irwin, I'm President of CWA Local 2108, and
- 2 I'm here today on behalf of Barry Hill, our member.
- 3 President Shelton spoke this morning about attacks on
- 4 unions. Verizon, like a lot of big employers, is a
- 5 bully.
- They will treat our members as badly as
- 7 they can get away with. That's why it's so important
- 8 that we police their actions, and we use every tool
- 9 available to us to protect our members, whether that's
- 10 relying on contract provisions or legal protections
- 11 that we have.
- 12 The Appeals Committee has written out the
- 13 facts for you. I hope that you all had a chance to
- 14 see the flyer that we passed out this morning to see
- 15 the facts that we wanted you to consider. I'm not
- 16 going to repeat all of those, I would just like to
- 17 make a couple of key points.
- 18 Changes to attendance plans are a
- 19 mandatory subject of bargaining. An employer needs
- 20 to tell the union we intend to make a change to the
- 21 plan, which then gives the union the opportunity to
- 22 request bargaining if they choose to do that. That

- 1 did not happen in this case.
- Verizon just decided to unilaterally
- 3 implement their plan differently and do something
- 4 they had never done before -- it's a violation of the
- 5 National Labor Relations Act. Our local requested
- 6 numerous times of our district through our staff rep
- 7 as is our process for board charges to be filed about
- 8 this issue, but that didn't happen.
- 9 Verizon changed how they applied their
- 10 Regional Attendance Plan after our 49-day strike in
- 11 2016. Our RAP states, and this is a quote out of the
- 12 plan, "Target dates are extended due to full days of
- 13 approved leaves of absence." -- Full days of
- 14 approved leaves of absence -- that's the only reason
- 15 it's given in the plan as far as why target dates
- 16 will be extended, and with the exception of this it's
- 17 the only time that they have been extended since
- 18 2001.
- 19 And the example they give in their
- 20 verbiage is as an FMLA or educational leave. Verizon
- 21 does not and has not extended target dates for any
- 22 other reason. If our members have a death in the

- 1 family, if they're on jury duty, if they're off the
- 2 job for union business for a few days here and there
- 3 -- none of those things extend a target date.
- 4 They're only extended due to time on an
- 5 approved leave of absence.
- In the -- On page 3 of the Appeals
- 7 Committee report it says the RAP states an employee must be
- 8 at work for six months without a chargeable absence
- 9 to regress to his or her prior step of the RAP.
- 10 Those words are nowhere in our plan. Those words
- 11 don't exist -- the only people who've said those
- 12 words are CWA.
- 13 Time spent on strike is not a chargeable
- 14 absence either. If it was, all of our members who
- 15 participated in our 2016 strike would have been
- 16 placed on or progressed through the Regional
- 17 Attendance Plan whenever they returned from the
- 18 strike and, of course, that did not happen.
- 19 When we were on strike for two weeks in
- 20 2011, I have no knowledge -- and at that time we had
- 21 about 3,000 people in our local. I have no knowledge
- 22 of any of our members having their target dates

- 1 extended due to time on strike.
- I have spent hours looking through
- 3 grievance files from 2011, '12, and '13 to look at
- 4 people who had a lot of attendance issues to see if I
- 5 could find a single case where any member had their
- 6 target date extended due to the two weeks on strike
- 7 in 2011 in our bargaining unit, and I could find
- 8 none.
- 9 And I'd also like to make the point
- 10 Verizon hasn't made any claims that they extended
- 11 target dates in the past. We've done this before so
- 12 why are you arguing about us doing it now? Verizon
- 13 hasn't made that claim.
- Now, Board charges should have been filed
- 15 on this issue, but they weren't. So here we are today
- 16 -- grievances were filed. We have about half a dozen
- 17 in my local who were filed over this issue -- Barry
- 18 Hill is just kind of the lead dog.
- 19 We can get justice for Barry Hill and the
- 20 others who are similarly situated by taking this
- 21 issue before an arbitrator. We can prove to our good
- 22 members that we fight for them. And I think you can

- 1 see in the documents -- I hope it's clear during the
- 2 time that Barry Hill's -- his target date was
- 3 extended, he had a subsequent absence -- he has
- 4 diabetes --
- 5 CHAIRMAN SHELTON: Times up.
- 6 MS. IRWIN: My time is up? Okay, if we
- 7 don't fight for 49 days, who do we fight for?
- 8 CHAIRMAN SHELTON: Delegate at the
- 9 "Questions" mic?
- 10 MR. SIMPSON: Yes, Chuck Simpson, the
- 11 President of CWA Local 2204. My question centers on
- 12 the remark in the report that says, "Unfortunately
- 13 the committee believes that President Irwin's
- 14 argument will be unsuccessful and that CWA cannot
- 15 prevail at arbitration." Specifically, what did you
- 16 use to arrive at that determination?
- 17 MR. ALIRE: Oh, we reviewed the file in
- 18 complete -- everything that was turned in, such as the
- 19 grievance notes, the appeals, comments from President
- 20 Irwin and the member.
- 21 MR. SIMPSON: Can I have a second
- 22 question?

- 1 CHAIRMAN SHELTON: Yes, you're entitled to
- 2 a second question.
- 3 MR. SIMPSON: When you speak of those
- 4 documents, are there specific items in there or just
- 5 generally everything overall that's used to determine
- 6 it would not be successful?
- 7 MR. ALIRE: Well general -- everything
- 8 that was included, but as we said, we did meet with
- 9 the President, she provided more information and
- 10 such.
- 11 MR. SIMPSON: Thank you.
- 12 CHAIRMAN SHELTON: Delegate at the "For"
- 13 microphone.
- 14 MR. TREMENTOZZI: My name is Don
- 15 Trementozzi, President of Local 1400 New Hampshire.
- 16 This is -- good morning, brothers and sisters. This
- 17 is very simple -- it's not that complicated. When
- 18 you go on strike for seven weeks, you didn't work.
- 19 You don't accumulate any time towards a
- 20 discipline of having it regress. It's really the
- 21 issue before you. It has nothing to do with the
- 22 union and filing a Board charge. That may be

- 1 significant but not here. It has nothing to do with
- 2 anything outside of challenging the company,
- 3 negotiating, or demanding to bargain over the change
- 4 in the absence of the program -- discipline program
- 5 That has nothing to do with that issue.
- 6 The issue here is she did not regress during the seven
- 7 week strike because we didn't work. Everybody in
- 8 this room is willing to fight. I was on a four-month
- 9 strike with Fair Point, seven weeks with Verizon. We're
- 10 all willing to fight brothers and sisters, but this
- 11 issue here is very simple -- she did not accumulate
- 12 any time during the strike to have her discipline
- 13 regress.
- 14 Therefore, she had to work another seven weeks
- 15 or six weeks to have it regress, and that just did not
- 16 happen and did not stay out of trouble and got fined
- 17 -- that's the issue.
- 18 CHAIRMAN SHELTON: Delegate at the
- 19 "Questions" mic?
- 20 MR. DULANEY: Yes, my question is -- and I
- 21 believe the Appeals Committee --
- 22 CHAIRMAN SHELTON: Name and local number

- 1 please?
- 2 MR. DULANEY: Oh I'm sorry, Bill Dulaney,
- 3 CWA Local 2101. How did the Appeals Committee come
- 4 up with the point that the RAP states that an
- 5 employee must be at work for six months without a
- 6 chargeable absence to regress his or her step --
- 7 because I don't see it anywhere in the RAP plan that
- 8 they must be at work.
- 9 MR. ALIRE: From the file that we looked
- 10 at it is under a Regional Attendance Plan -- the RAP,
- 11 it does state that requirement.
- 12 MR. DULANEY: It does? I have it in front
- 13 of me, so could you direct me to that? I do see where
- 14 it says, "Advise the employee that the absence
- 15 qualifies for FMLA coverage, the employee will not be
- 16 charged with an absence but that his or her target
- 17 date will be extended by the amount of FMLA absence.
- 18 Also the company is to advise if the absence does not
- 19 qualify for FMLA coverage, the company will determine
- 20 whether the absence qualifies as an exempt. If it
- 21 doesn't, the FLMA coverage here will be a chargeable
- 22 absence, but I see nowhere does it say that they must

- 1 be at work -- nowhere.
- 2 And correct me if I'm wrong, while we were
- 3 out on strike if anyone -- if anybody was out on a
- 4 medical restriction leave of absence, did they extend
- 5 that -- the 150 days when -- for the people that are
- 6 familiar with the Verizon contract?
- 7 CHAIRMAN SHELTON: Delegate, your question
- 8 is to the Appeals Committee.
- 9 MR. DULANEY: Oh I'm sorry.
- MS. GAMBINI: We're pulling the file. We
- 11 have the file up here so we're just going through the
- 12 file.
- MR. DULANEY: I'm sorry, repeat that?
- MR. ALIRE: We're reviewing the file right
- 15 now.
- MR. DULANEY: Okay, thanks.
- MR. ALIRE: Please bear with us, we're
- 18 looking through the file -- it's a thick file.
- 19 CHAIRMAN SHELTON: So it appears the
- 20 Appeals Committee cannot find that reference. Are
- 21 there -- is there any other discussion?
- MR. DULANEY: So the answer was --

- 1 CHAIRMAN SHELTON: I can't find -- well
- 2 they can't find it, but they're still looking. Is there
- 3 any other discussion? Seeing no one heading for a
- 4 microphone, sorry there's somebody at the "Motions"
- 5 mic. So delegate at the "Motions" microphone you can
- 6 speak on your motion.
- 7 MR. BENITEZ: No, I'm going to withdraw
- 8 the motion just so we can try to move forward better,
- 9 so I'm not going to make the motion now. I was going
- 10 to make a motion, but let's try to move forward with
- 11 this okay?
- 12 CHAIRMAN SHELTON: We'll try again.
- 13 Seeing no one heading towards a microphone, the
- 14 motion before you is the Appeals Committee
- 15 recommendation and Appeal Number 1. All those in
- 16 favor of the Appeals Committee recommendation please
- 17 raise your hand. Down hands, opposed by like sign --
- 18 the motion is defeated. The case will be arbitrated.
- 19 MS. GAMBINI: Appeal Number 2 I recognize
- 20 President Orange Richardson.
- 21 MR. RICHARDSON: Good morning. CWA Local
- 22 3204 President Edmund Barlow has appealed the

- 1 decision of the CWA Executive Board regarding a
- 2 grievance involving the application of Article 15 to
- 3 work assigned to electronic technicians and testing
- 4 technicians under the BST AT&T Southeast Collective
- 5 Bargaining Agreement.
- 6 The Executive Board upheld the decision of
- 7 President Shelton not to arbitrate this grievance.
- 8 The appeal is timely and properly before the
- 9 Presidents Meeting. In 2016, AT&T reassigned certain
- 10 technical work that had been performed by Legacy T
- 11 technicians to BST AT&T Southeast electronic
- 12 technicians and testing technicians.
- The grievance alleged that the
- 14 reassignment of work violated Article 15 of the
- 15 Collective Bargaining Agreement because the company
- 16 failed to notify the union about the new job
- 17 assignments and failed to negotiate with the union
- 18 about the terms.
- 19 Article 15 of the Collective Bargaining
- 20 Agreement requires the company to give notice to the
- 21 union and to negotiate over certain issues when it
- 22 "creates a new job title or job classification," or

- 1 "restructures or redefines an existing" job title.
- 2 President Barlow maintains that the AT&T's
- 3 Southeast technician job classification was
- 4 "redefined" because the new task required new
- 5 training and job aids. The issue here is whether the
- 6 assignment of former Legacy T work constituted a
- 7 "restructure or redefinition" of the job titles.
- A prior arbitration award, CWA and AT&T
- 9 Corporation 1996, recognized that the "the employer
- 10 has some latitude to alter or adjust the non-core or
- 11 peripheral duties of bargaining unit jobs without
- 12 contractual consequences."
- In this case, skills, abilities and job
- 14 duties required for the assigned work are similar to
- 15 those already possessed and performed by AT&T
- 16 Southeast technicians.
- 17 It is unlikely that an arbitrator would
- 18 conclude that the addition of the new work
- 19 constituted a "restructuring" or "redefinition" of
- 20 the title. Rather, an arbitrator would likely
- 21 conclude that the assigned work was not a
- 22 restructuring, but instead was akin to simply

- 1 requiring additional testing on the same circuit.
- 2 President Barlow also refers to an
- 3 arbitration case won by CWA District 6 in similar
- 4 circumstances. However, the case involved a
- 5 different issue, differential pay for performing
- 6 higher rated -- a higher rated job and a different
- 7 collective bargaining agreement that contained
- 8 language, which allowed the union to prevail.
- 9 The Appeals Committee believes that these
- 10 cases are sufficiently different from one another to
- 11 preclude the application of the District 6 case to
- 12 the current grievance. Accordingly, the Appeals
- 13 Committee recommends that the decision of Executive
- 14 Board be upheld and the appeal of Local 3204
- 15 President Edmund Barlow be denied.
- 16 CHAIRMAN SHELTON: Is there any
- 17 discussion? I think seeing no one going to a
- 18 microphone the motion before you is to adopt the
- 19 Appeals Committee recommendation in Appeal Number 2.
- 20 All those in favor please raise your hand. Down
- 21 hands, opposed by like sign -- the motion carries.
- MS. GAMBINI: Appeal Number 3: the Chair

- 1 recognizes once again President Orange Richardson.
- 2 MR. RICHARDSON: Good morning for the
- 3 second time. CWA Local 3204 President Edmund Barlow
- 4 has appealed the decision of the Executive -- the CWA
- 5 Executive Board regarding a grievance involving the
- 6 application of Article 15 to work assigned to service
- 7 representatives under the BST AT&T Southeast
- 8 Collective Bargaining Agreement.
- 9 The Executive Board upheld the decision of
- 10 President Shelton not to arbitrate this grievance.
- 11 The appeal is timely and properly before the
- 12 Presidents Meeting. This case is substantially
- 13 similar to Appeal 2.
- 14 In 2016, AT&T reassigned certain work that
- 15 had been performed under the Legacy T contract to BST
- 16 AT&T Southeast service representatives. The
- 17 grievance alleged that the reassignment of work
- 18 violated Article 15 of the Collective Bargaining
- 19 Agreement because the company failed to notify the
- 20 union about the new job assignments and failed to
- 21 negotiate with the union about the terms.
- 22 Article 15 of the Collective Bargaining

- 1 Agreement requires the company to give notice to the
- 2 union and to negotiate over certain issues when it
- 3 "creates a new job title or classification" or
- 4 "restructures or redefines an existing" job title.
- 5 President Barlow maintains that the AT&T
- 6 Southeast service representative job classification
- 7 was "redefined" because the new task required new
- 8 systems and terminology. The issue here is whether
- 9 the assignment of former Legacy T work constituted a
- 10 "restructure or redefinition" of the title.
- 11 A prior arbitration award, CWA AT&T
- 12 Corporation 1996, recognized that "the employer has
- 13 some latitude to alter or adjust the non-core or
- 14 peripheral duties of bargaining unit jobs without
- 15 contractual consequences."
- In this case, the skills, abilities, and job
- 17 duties required for the assigned work are similar to
- 18 those already possessed and performed by AT&T
- 19 Southeast service representatives. It is unlikely
- 20 that an arbitrator would conclude that the addition
- 21 of the new work constituted a "restructuring" or
- 22 "redefinition" of the title.

- 1 Rather, an arbitrator would likely
- 2 conclude that the reassigned work was not
- 3 restructuring, but instead was simply requiring a new
- 4 system -- requiring new systems and terminology.
- 5 President Barlow also refers to the arbitration case
- 6 won by CWA District 6 in similar circumstances.
- 7 However, that case involved a different issue,
- 8 differential pay for performing a higher rated job
- 9 and a different collective bargaining agreement that
- 10 contained language which allowed the union to
- 11 prevail.
- 12 The Appeals Committee believes that these
- 13 cases are sufficiently different from one another to
- 14 preclude the application of the District 6 case to
- 15 the current grievance. Accordingly, the Appeals
- 16 Committee recommends that the decision of the
- 17 Executive Board be upheld and the appeal of Local
- 18 3204 President Edmund Barlow be denied.
- 19 CHAIRMAN SHELTON: Is there any
- 20 discussion? Seeing no one coming to a microphone --
- 21 at least I hope, what's before you is the Appeals
- 22 Committee recommendation on Appeal Number 3. All

- 1 those in favor, please raise your hand. Down hands --
- 2 opposed by like sign. The motion carries.
- 3 MS. GAMBINI: Appeal number --
- 4 CHAIRMAN SHELTON: Let me interrupt you
- 5 for a minute. We need the -- Marge Krueger from the
- 6 Credentials Committee needs to make a supplemental
- 7 report here.
- 8 MS. KRUEGER: Hello again President
- 9 Shelton, delegates, and guests. The Credentials
- 10 Committee would like to report credentials in
- 11 category 2 properly executed, but late for the
- 12 following Locals -- 1158, 1106, 1133, 4100, 6311,
- 13 6355, 84101. The committee moves that these
- 14 delegates be seated.
- 15 CHAIRMAN SHELTON: Is there a second? All
- 16 those in favor, please raise your hands. Down hands
- 17 -- opposed by like sign. The motion carries the
- 18 delegates are seated.
- MS. GAMBINI: Appeal Number 4 was
- 20 withdrawn this morning after the report was printed.

22 Appeal Number 5: the Chair recognizes

- 1 President Sarah Harreus.
- 2 MS. HARREUS: Hello and good morning. CWA
- 3 Local 14430 President David R. Gerard has appealed
- 4 the decision of CWA Executive Board regarding a
- 5 grievance involving the disqualification of member
- 6 Kelly Synal from employment. The Executive Board
- 7 upheld the decision of President Shelton not to
- 8 arbitrate the grievance.
- 9 The appeal is timely and properly before
- 10 the Presidents Meeting. In April of 2016, employer
- 11 Northstar Aerospace announced that its New Bedford
- 12 Park facility was closing. The union and the
- 13 employer bargained a closure agreement that
- 14 explicitly stated, "The payments and other
- 15 considerations provided are in full settlement of all
- 16 rights and benefits arising under the collective
- 17 bargaining agreement that relate in any way to the
- 18 termination of an employment relationship and
- 19 employee as part of the closure."
- 20 Member Synal had approximately 15 years of
- 21 service in April of 2016. To avoid layoff, member
- 22 Synal bumped into another position. In August of

- 1 2016, the company disqualified her from the bumped
- 2 position causing her to be separated from the
- 3 payroll.
- 4 The union grieved her disqualification.
- 5 During the grievance, member Synal accepted the
- 6 severance package offered to employees under the
- 7 closure agreement.
- 8 As part of her acceptance of the package,
- 9 consistent with the closure agreement signed by the
- 10 union, member Synal signed a general waiver and
- 11 release stating in pertinent part, "In exchange for
- 12 the promises made by the company in this agreement,
- 13 employee waives and releases all known and unknown
- 14 claims and causes of action of any kind he has or may
- 15 have against the company, including, but not limited
- 16 to all claims and causes of action related to or in
- 17 any way growing out of his employment and/or
- 18 separation from the employment with the company."
- 19 The General Waiver and Release included a
- 20 list of causes of action released which included
- 21 claims that the company had violated any type of
- 22 labor contract. Thus, not only had the union released the

1 company in the closure agreement, but also Synal expressively

- 2 and clearly waived her right to bring any claim
- 3 against the company arising from her employment or
- 4 removal from the payroll under the closure agreement.
- 5 President Gerard agreed that the local had
- 6 not received the response to its document request and
- 7 that Synal should not have been required to decide
- 8 whether to accept the severance package. However,
- 9 the severance agreement signed by member Synal is
- 10 enforceable.
- 11 Any financial hardships she may have
- 12 suffered did not amount to the unlawful coercion or
- 13 duress sufficient to render the agreement
- 14 unenforceable. Coupled with the union's waiver in
- 15 the closure agreement, member Synal's execution of
- 16 the General Release, and acceptance of the severance
- 17 payment, rendered the grievance not arbitral.
- 18 Accordingly, the Appeals Committee
- 19 recommends the decision of Executive Board be upheld
- 20 and the appeal of 14430 President David Gerard be
- 21 denied.
- 22 CHAIRMAN SHELTON: Is there a second? The

- 1 Committee made the motion is there a second? Much
- 2 better. Is there any discussion? Seeing no one
- 3 heading towards the microphone, before you is Appeal
- 4 Number 5 with the Appeals Committee's recommendation
- 5 in Appeal Number 5. All those in favor, please raise
- 6 your hand. Down hands, opposed by like sign, the
- 7 motion carries.
- 8 MS. GAMBINI: I will read Appeal Number 6.
- 9 CWA Local 3204 President Edmund Barlow and member
- 10 Robin McClam have appealed the decision of the CWA
- 11 Executive Board regarding a grievance involving the
- 12 termination of member Robin McClam for benefits
- 13 fraud.
- 14 The Executive Board upheld the decision of
- 15 President Shelton not to arbitrate this grievance.
- 16 The appeal is timely and properly before the
- 17 Presidents Meeting. Member McClam was a Multi-Media
- 18 Technician employed by AT&T Southeast.
- 19 She had 30 years of service. Member
- 20 McClam was diagnosed with benign paroxysmal
- 21 positional vertigo which means that she suffers from
- 22 episodes of dizziness and the sensation of spinning

- 1 with certain head movements.
- 2 She applied for and was granted
- 3 intermittent FMLA for this condition. The absence
- 4 record over the past 5 years, 2013 to 2017, indicates
- 5 that member McClam exhibited a pattern of taking
- 6 approved illness, including two weekend days with the
- 7 8th day being a vacation day or other excused absence
- 8 day.
- 9 Using vacation or other excused absence day
- 10 on the 8th day of the absence prevents the employee
- 11 from going out on disability. The documents
- 12 substantiate this pattern occurred 26 times between
- 13 2013 and 2017.
- 14 Because of this pattern the company
- 15 surveilled member McClam on three days during the
- 16 hours that she was scheduled to be at work. After
- 17 she had called in and stated that she could not work
- 18 due to her FMLA covered condition, she was observed
- 19 walking, driving to several non-urgent locations,
- 20 sitting, entering, exiting buildings, filling out
- 21 paperwork, carrying grocery bags, and speaking with
- 22 her landscapers.

- 1 The company had a doctor who specializes
- 2 in occupational medicine review the surveillance
- 3 video tape, and her opinion was that while Miss McClam
- 4 was engaged in these activities, she showed no signs
- 5 of suffering from the condition with which she was
- 6 diagnosed.
- 7 President Barlow argues that member McClam
- 8 had no medical restrictions that she violated. Her
- 9 doctor stated that her restrictions were from going
- 10 to work and her duties, which included talking on the
- 11 phone and using a computer.
- 12 She was not seen performing those duties
- 13 -- activities. However, either the condition or the
- 14 medication prescribed for her condition would have
- 15 prevented her from driving, which she was observed
- 16 doing.
- 17 The evidence and the documentation in the
- 18 file are sufficient to convince an arbitrator that
- 19 member McClam was not suffering from intense
- 20 dizziness that characterized the condition for which
- 21 she had FLMA leave.
- 22 Further, it is not believable that she

- 1 suffered this condition in a similar pattern 26 times
- 2 between 2013 and 2017. An arbitrator would find that
- 3 the company had just cause for discharge.
- 4 Accordingly, the Appeals Committee recommends that
- 5 the decision of the Executive Board be upheld and the
- 6 appeal of Local 3204 President Edmund Barlow be
- 7 denied.
- 8 CHAIRMAN SHELTON: Is there a second? All
- 9 those in favor of the Appeals Committee
- 10 recommendation in Appeal Number 6 please raise your
- 11 hand. Down hands -- opposed by like sign. The
- 12 motion carries.
- MS. GAMBINI: Appeal Number 7 the Chair
- 14 recognizes President Sarah Harreus.
- MS. HARREUS: CWA Local 4322 President
- 16 Daniel Frazier has appealed the decision of the CWA
- 17 Executive Board regarding a grievance involving
- 18 member Brittany Walter. AT&T Midwest issued Miss
- 19 Walter a written warning and a one-day suspension for
- 20 her using a cell phone in a work area. The Executive
- 21 Board upheld the decision of President Shelton not to
- 22 arbitrate this grievance. The appeal is timely and

- 1 properly before the Presidents Meeting.
- 2 Member Walter, a sales consultant working
- 3 in Dayton, Ohio -- she was hired on October 10th,
- 4 2009. Prior to the incident at issue, member Walter
- 5 had been disciplined three times for cell phone
- 6 violations.
- 7 On December 3rd, 2016, member Walter
- 8 arrived 10 minutes early for her shift -- she
- 9 received a call from her ill daughter, she walked off
- 10 the floor to use her phone. When she returned to
- 11 the floor to log in, she was 16 minutes late. She was
- 12 heard by the manager still talking on the phone while
- 13 she re-entered the work floor.
- 14 She was paid for her full tour and was not
- 15 issued any discipline for being tardy. During the
- 16 investigation meeting member Walter stated that, "I
- 17 feel like you, the manager, did not care because you
- 18 heard me, and I was upset, "indicating that she was
- 19 in fact on her phone while on the floor and aware
- 20 management had observed her.
- 21 President Frazier argued that member
- 22 Walter was not on the floor when she was on the

- 1 phone. The evidence in the file however, indicates
- 2 otherwise. As noted above, member Walter had been
- 3 disciplined three times for improper cell phone use.
- 4 Her management's comment, "I know that wasn't you on
- 5 the phone, " was sarcastic as President Frazier noted.

- 7 President Frazier argued that this comment
- 8 referred to her tardiness, however the comment
- 9 obviously addressed her continued improper cell phone
- 10 use. For these reasons the Appeals Committee
- 11 recommends that the Executive Board's decision be
- 12 upheld and the appeal of Local 4322 President Daniel
- 13 Frazier be denied.
- 14 CHAIRMAN SHELTON: Is there a second? At
- 15 the "Against" microphone, the delegate may speak.
- MR. MURRAY: Thank you, David Murray,
- 17 Vice President of Local 4322. I'm here
- 18 on behalf of Dan Frazier who is currently in the
- 19 Midwest bargaining with AT&T.
- 20 President Shelton, Secretary-Treasurer
- 21 Steffens, Executive Board members, Appeals Committee
- 22 members, staff, and delegates. I rise to speak on the

- 1 appeal at hand. The grievant in this case, Brittnay
- 2 Walter, is a member of my Local 4322, but this issue
- 3 belongs to everyone in this room who represents CWA
- 4 members at AT&T.
- 5 As outlined on December 3rd, 2016, Brittany
- 6 Walter was late to work -- tardy due to the illness
- 7 of one of her five children. She became aware of
- 8 this prior to the start of her shift and was
- 9 prevented from being on time because she was on her
- 10 personal cell phone in a designated area where cell
- 11 phone usage is permitted, which is the hallway outside
- 12 or off the sales floor.
- 13 She was making arrangements with a family
- 14 member to take care of her child, and because of the
- 15 length of that call, she lost track of time. The
- 16 Appeals Committee report reads, "When she returned to
- 17 the floor she was 16 minutes late, and that is
- 18 accurate." She did log in 16 minutes late.
- 19 However, the statement that she was heard
- 20 by the manager still talking on the phone when she
- 21 re-entered the work floor is not accurate, and no
- 22 evidence exists in the case file or anywhere else to

- 1 my knowledge to support this contention.
- 2 I'm not even sure where this is coming
- 3 from. In the first few appeals through the steps of
- 4 this process -- these steps, she was accused of
- 5 taking the call on the sales floor and then walking
- 6 out. Now here we are at the Presidents Meeting, and
- 7 now it's the other way around -- now she's supposedly
- 8 on it coming back in. There's nothing in there to
- 9 support that.
- 10 Further, the report states that during
- 11 the investigation meeting, member Walter stated that,
- 12 "I felt like you, the manager did not care because
- 13 you heard me, and I was upset." This statement was
- 14 made in the meeting where the discipline was
- 15 administered -- there was no investigation meeting.
- 16 And it does not indicate in any way that
- 17 she was on her cell phone while on the work floor
- 18 because that simply never happened. The facts are
- 19 that Brittnay's manager observed her out in the
- 20 hallway which is supported by the statements made by
- 21 this very same manager during this meeting where the
- 22 discipline was administered.

```
1 The manager went out into the hallway
```

- 2 looking for Brittany when she noticed that she was
- 3 not at her desk at the start of her tour. All
- 4 interactions between Brittany and her manager prior
- 5 to her concluding the call, and then going back onto
- 6 the sales floor to log in took place out in the
- 7 hallway -- that's where the statement was made.
- 8 She came out in the hall, Brittany saw her
- 9 manager. "She saw me on the phone, she had to know I
- 10 was upset, and she just went back inside." That was
- 11 the end of it -- the manager. Brittany was simply
- 12 tardy -- nothing more and nothing less, but I think
- 13 it's out of just pure vindictiveness and because of
- 14 her history with being disciplined for cell phone
- 15 usage on the floor, the company chose to call her
- 16 tardy a code of business violation, and they
- 17 disciplined her accordingly.
- 18 And that is why this matter must be taken
- 19 to arbitration because if AT&T can call being tardy a
- 20 code of business conduct violation and get away with
- 21 it, where does that end?
- It puts every one of our AT&T members

- 1 nationwide in danger and left unchecked to the whims
- 2 of AT&T management. I ask that you stand with my
- 3 Local 4322 on this matter because in doing so, you
- 4 will be standing in like manner with every AT&T
- 5 member you represent, thank you.
- 6 And I would like to reserve any remaining
- 7 time I have in case there's any questions, if that's
- 8 permitted.
- 9 CHAIRMAN SHELTON: You can ask the
- 10 question from there.
- 11 MR. MURRAY: Well actually if someone has
- 12 a question that needs to be addressed by me, that's
- 13 what I meant.
- 14 CHAIRMAN SHELTON: Someone has a question?
- MR. MURRAY: If anyone does.
- 16 CHAIRMAN SHELTON: While we're waiting, the
- 17 Supreme Court report has come out, and we expected
- 18 that there may be or might be a Janus decision today.
- 19 They have not made that decision today so it could be
- 20 next Monday or possibly later in the week -- the
- 21 delegate on the "Questions" microphone?
- MR. EMBRY: Matthew Embry, Local 3310,

- 1 Louisville, Kentucky, President. My question is that
- 2 the gentleman at the "Against" mic stated that
- 3 there's no evidence in the grievance file stating
- 4 that she was actually witnessed on the floor speaking
- 5 on the phone, yet the Appeals Committee says that
- 6 there was evidence. Can you elaborate specifically
- 7 what evidence in the grievance file shows that she
- 8 was, in fact, on the floor speaking on her cell
- 9 phone?
- 10 MS. GAMBINI: The Appeals Committee has
- 11 the investigatory notes that has member Walter
- 12 quoting that she in fact noticed -- sorry one moment --
- 13 that her manager, Janelle, heard her on the phone and
- 14 didn't seem to care so she logged in -- so we took
- 15 that as she was on the floor and logged in at that
- 16 moment.
- 17 MR. EMBRY: A second question follow-up
- 18 would be, couldn't that also have been that the
- 19 manager knew she was outside off the floor speaking
- 20 on her cell phone just as well?
- 21 MS. GAMBINI: Yes, but with the history of
- 22 this member and her past violations of cell phone

- 1 improper use over the past years we took that into
- 2 consideration.
- 3 MR. EMBRY: One final question is couldn't
- 4 we offer --
- 5 CHAIRMAN SHELTON: No, because there's a
- 6 delegate behind you, you're only entitled to two
- 7 questions. Yeah, please when you're going to go to
- 8 any of the microphones, call in right away so we
- 9 know. And that delegate that just sat down, if you
- 10 have another question, you can get in line again at
- 11 the microphone. -- the delegate at the "Questions" mic?
- 12 MR. JOHNSON: Thank you, President Shelton.
- 13 My name is Jason Johnson, Local President of 81408
- 14 United Optical Workers of Schenectady, New York. My
- 15 question is -- is there any record that shows when
- 16 she ended that phone call versus when she clocked in?
- 17 Thank you.
- 18 MS. GAMBINI: No, we have no record of when
- 19 she actually ended that phone call, just a record
- 20 that she was logged in at 11:16.
- 21 MR. JOHNSON: Thank you.
- 22 CHAIRMAN SHELTON: The delegate at the

- 1 "Questions" microphone?
- MS. PACKER: Valerie Packer, Local 7621,
- 3 Idaho. AT&T commonly has video in most all of their
- 4 locations and stores. Was there any video presented
- 5 with this grievance where she was when she was
- 6 talking on the phone?
- 7 MS. GAMBINI: There's no indication -- it
- 8 does not state where she was when she was on the
- 9 phone.
- MS. PACKER: Thank you.
- 11 MS. GAMBINI: Oh, no video, I'm sorry --
- 12 no video or surveillance.
- 13 CHAIRMAN SHELTON: Again on the
- "Questions" microphone?
- MS. MCLEROY: Yes, Patty McLeroy, Local
- 16 3710. I want to clarify something. Did she log in
- 17 and then go out and take a cell phone call or am I
- 18 correct in reading that she never logged in, she
- 19 took the call and then was 16 minutes late and went
- 20 in and logged in at that point?
- 21 MS. GAMBINO: Correct, she did not log in
- 22 until 11:16.

- 1 MS. MCLEROY: Okay so she was not on the
- 2 company's payroll when she was on the cell phone call
- 3 correct?
- 4 MS. GAMBINI: She was not on company
- 5 payroll.
- 6 MS. MCLEROY: Thank you.
- 7 CHAIRMAN SHELTON: The delegate at the
- 8 "Questions" microphone?
- 9 MS. IRWIN: Thank you, Marilyn Irwin,
- 10 President, Local 2108. The quote that you read -- I
- 11 think there are some assumptions being made, and when
- 12 I heard it I wondered if that wasn't the young lady's
- 13 explanation for why she didn't go to her boss and
- 14 explain what she was doing for this 16 minutes
- 15 because her boss saw her on the phone upset outside
- 16 of the workplace.
- 17 So I just wondered if an incorrect
- 18 assumption is being made by the quote that you read
- 19 that she was on the phone in the workplace -- that's
- 20 her explanation for why didn't you go to the boss and
- 21 say, "Boss, this is why I'm logging in 16 minutes
- 22 late, it's because I was out in the hall talking to

- 1 my sick child on my cell phone when indeed the boss
- 2 already knew that, so she's explaining why she didn't
- 3 go tell her boss that, just went to her desk and
- 4 logged in. That's how it felt to me.
- 5 MR. MURRAY: And that is correct.
- 6 MS. GAMBINI: Per the investigatory notes
- 7 the manager stated that she went out to look for the
- 8 member and advised because she didn't see her in her
- 9 work area at that time and when she seen the member
- 10 she had stated, "I know that wasn't you on the
- 11 phone." She did recognize the member Walter -- she
- 12 heard her on the phone saying, "Okay I gotta go,
- 13 bye, " and then member Walter logged in.
- 14 MS. IRWIN: But as you said -- follow-up
- 15 question.
- 16 CHAIRMAN SHELTON: You're entitled to
- 17 another question.
- 18 MS. IRWIN: The mics -- okay, but you're
- 19 assuming where this took place correct -- this
- 20 conversation?
- 21 MS. GAMBINI: Yes, per the investigatory
- 22 notes.

- 1 MS. IRWIN: Thank you.
- 2 MS. GAMBINI: And the additional
- 3 discipline that she had had after.
- 4 CHAIRMAN SHELTON: The delegate at the
- 5 "Against" microphone you still have a minute and 13
- 6 seconds left if you'd like to speak.
- 7 MR. MURRAY: If it's allowed, I'd like to
- 8 address that. Yeah, what the representative earlier
- 9 said -- what the delegate said earlier is correct.
- 10 The manager came out and saw her and that's what she
- 11 was referencing. You knew I was tardy because you
- 12 knew where I was at, and you saw me on the phone --
- 13 that's really all this was about -- that she was not
- 14 on the phone when she re-entered.
- 15 She concluded the call. Because she had
- 16 been disciplined prior; she had issues with cell phone
- 17 usage before on the floor now, not out in the hallway.
- 18 That's why her manager Janelle Harris made that smart
- 19 remark to her about, "I know that's not you on the
- 20 phone, that's not the reason you're tardy." That's
- 21 what that statement made -- and that was made out in
- the hallway.

- 1 Brittany knew better than to walk in with
- 2 her phone, you know, talking on it -- she knows
- 3 better than that. She concluded the call, 15 to 16
- 4 minutes late to work that day -- that's all it was.
- 5 She never had the phone out on the sales floor, and
- 6 there's no supporting documentation or evidence to
- 7 that end.
- 8 So yeah, it's simply what it is -- it's
- 9 pretty simple, she was tardy, and they chose to call
- 10 it a COBC just to stick it to her, thank you.
- 11 CHAIRMAN SHELTON: The delegate at the
- 12 "Questions" microphone?
- 13 MR. DUNLAP: Jim Dunlap, Local 9110, Nevada
- 14 Association of Public Safety Officers. We conduct
- 15 investigations from time to time. The first question
- 16 is, was the member properly represented at the time
- 17 that she was interviewed or investigated about this
- 18 incident?
- 19 Secondly, was there additional witnesses,
- 20 additional supervisors, additional co-workers that
- 21 were present during the allegation of this incident
- 22 taking place? We had heard that there's no

- 1 surveillance, but if it's a work area, or work space
- 2 there had to have been other people that were around
- 3 that could have contributed to the investigation, and
- 4 if they weren't interviewed then I would say that's
- 5 not a proper and thorough investigation by the
- 6 company.
- 7 MS. GAMBINI: There's nothing in the file
- 8 that indicates that. We're simply going on what was
- 9 in the file and the information that we have.
- 10 Questions before the Appeals Committee with the
- 11 surveillance and information again was not provided
- 12 in the file, and President Frazier has the bargaining
- 13 -- we did not see the Vice President at the Appeals
- 14 Committee to ask additional questions or clarifying
- 15 due to travel.
- 16 CHAIRMAN SHELTON: So seeing no one
- 17 heading towards a microphone, you have before you the
- 18 Appeals Committee recommendation in Appeal Number 7.
- 19 All those in favor please raise your hand. Those
- 20 opposed -- the motion doesn't carry. That's it.
- 21 So that concludes the appeals that are
- 22 before you. I'd like to thank the Appeals Committee,

- 1 they did a great job. And I'd like to -- so there is
- 2 a delegate at the "Questions" mic, and because of the
- 3 nature of what she's going to do, I'm going to allow
- 4 it, although we shouldn't be doing this according to
- 5 the Constitution at the Presidents Meeting, but the
- 6 delegate at the "Questions" mic please identify
- 7 yourself.
- 8 MS. WOJTOWICZ: Shari Wojtowicz, 7250.
- 9 Thank you, President Shelton. Two things -- we have a bus
- 10 leaving tomorrow morning at 5 o'clock to do a
- 11 mobilization activity rally with the DirecTV folks
- 12 and enlist people into our Legacy T contract.
- So we're doing a huge rally tomorrow, we
- 14 have room on the bus, and if you would like to join us,
- 15 please see me. We have room for about 25 more people or
- 16 so. And I also have the drawing -- we did a 50/50
- 17 raffle for the Puerto Rico Relief. So this is something
- 18 we've been doing for over a year.
- 19 Every time we get together we've been
- 20 holding a 50/50 raffle to help raise money for the
- 21 brothers and sisters of CWA in Puerto Rico, and we'll
- 22 continue to do that until the federal government

- 1 provides them the relief that they are entitled to or
- 2 they should be entitled to as United States citizens.
- 3 Let's go -- oh no, look what just
- 4 happened! Put them all on the floor right, just pick
- 5 one here -- there you go, just pick one. Just pick
- 6 one. So we raised \$1,100 this morning so the winner
- 7 will get 50% of that, and I really can't see the
- 8 number because I only have one contact in.
- 9 CHAIRMAN SHELTON: \$550.
- 10 MS. WOJTOWICZ: Yeah, oh I know that math
- 11 sorry, I can't read this ticket. The ticket number
- 12 is 7890341. Really we can just leave them -- so my
- 13 tickets are on the table, check mine. 0341 -- is it
- 14 me? Oh, again, it's -- you've got one chance here,
- 15 claim your ticket or it's going to Puerto Rico, I
- 16 mean that's awesome too okay. Alright 0341? Thanks,
- 17 it's going to Puerto Rico, \$1,100.
- 18 CHAIRMAN SHELTON: So there is a -- are we
- 19 done? There is a delegate at the "Motions" mic.
- 20 MR. MURRAY: Gerald Murray, Local 6507. I
- 21 would like to make a motion to adjourn the meeting.
- 22 CHAIRMAN SHELTON: There is a motion to

- 1 adjourn. Just before we adjourn, I have one quick
- 2 announcement. After adjournment we are going to have
- 3 Secretary-Treasurer Sara Steffens give a financial
- 4 report. I would ask that you all stay for that. I
- 5 can't allow the folks that are lined up at the
- 6 "Questions" mic because as I read at the beginning of
- 7 this meeting, the only thing that we are able to do
- 8 constitutionally at the Presidents Meeting is
- 9 appeals.
- 10 I allowed Shari to do what she did because
- it was a 50/50 raffle, and I guess I shouldn't have,
- 12 but I did. So there is a motion before you to
- 13 adjourn. I'd like to also say thank you to our
- 14 observers, you did a great job. Thank you.
- 15 There's a challenge to the ruling that the
- 16 delegate is out of order. So the delegate is out of
- 17 order because it's unrelated to the business that
- 18 we're here for and that we already have a motion to
- 19 adjourn, which takes precedence; so I would ask the
- 20 delegate to take his seat. George, you can say
- 21 whatever you want after the meeting is adjourned,
- just let's get the meeting adjourned because the

```
1 Constitution says that the only thing we can do at
```

- 2 this meeting is appeals, and I can't change that --
- 3 that's what the Constitution says.
- 4 So if you let us adjourn the meeting, I
- 5 will let you go up to that microphone and say
- 6 whatever you want. The motion to adjourn has been
- 7 seconded, I assume that the delegate is withdrawing
- 8 his challenge of the Chair. The motion to adjourn
- 9 has been seconded. Before you is a motion to adjourn
- 10 -- all those in favor please raise your hands, down
- 11 hands, opposed by like sign -- we are adjourned.
- 12 (Whereupon the meeting was adjourned at
- 13 10:42 a.m.)

15

16

17

18

19

20

21